

CONTENTS

Summary	1
Part I: Current developments and prospects	9
Summary	11
1. Budgetary developments in the euro area and the EU Member States	13
1.1. The slow path to recovery	13
1.2. Short-term developments and prospects for the budgetary position and public debt	13
1.3. Government revenue and expenditure	17
2. Implementing the Stability and Growth Pact	26
2.1. The Excessive Deficit Procedure	26
3. Stability and convergence programmes set out the consolidation plans over the medium term	46
3.1. Macroeconomic scenarios	46
3.2. Time profile of consolidation	48
3.3. Composition of consolidation	51
3.4. Medium term objectives in the 2008-09 and 2009-10 rounds of SCPs	53
4. The long-term sustainability of public finances	66
4.1. The approach used to assess the long - term sustainability of public finances	66
4.2. Overall assessment	69
5. Current domestic fiscal framework reforms across the EU	73
5.1. Introduction	73
5.2. Overview of the information contained in the 2009 2010 SCPs	74
5.3. Type of measures according to the main elements of domestic frameworks	74
5.4. The assessment of the domestic fiscal frameworks reforms	78
5.5. Main conclusions	79
Part II: Evolving budgetary surveillance	81
Summary	83
1. Implementation of the Stability and Growth Pact throughout the crisis	85
1.1. Fiscal expansion over 2009-2010, conditional on fiscal space	85
1.2. The SGP and the fiscal exit strategy	86
1.3. Ongoing implementation of the fiscal exit strategy through the EDP recommendations	87
2. Statistical treatment of government support to financial institutions	94
2.1. Accounting issues in the context of the crisis	94
2.2. The Eurostat decision	94
2.3. Applying the rules to special cases	95
3. National fiscal frameworks	98
3.1. Introduction	98
3.2. Did domestic fiscal frameworks play a role in previous consolidation episodes?	98
3.3. Reviewing the main elements of fiscal frameworks: some guidelines	99

3.4.	The strengthening of domestic fiscal frameworks: general considerations	110
3.5.	Is there an ideal model of fiscal frameworks?	112
3.6.	Main conclusions	113
4.	Including implicit liabilities in the medium-term budgetary objectives	116
4.1.	MTOs in the revised SGP	116
4.2.	New MTOs take into account implicit liabilities due to ageing populations	116
5.	Developments in cyclically-adjusted budget balance measurement	120
5.1.	The potential output estimation and the problem of revisions	120
5.2.	The pro-cyclical nature of discretionary measures affecting tax revenues	124
6.	Correcting the cyclically-adjusted budget balance for current account imbalances	131
6.1.	Introduction	131
6.2.	Adjusting the CAB for current account imbalances	131
6.3.	Results	132
6.4.	Conclusion	135
Part III:	Fiscal policy, debt reduction and growth after the crisis	137
	Summary	139
1.	Experiences with past episodes of fast debt increase	142
2.	Illustrative projections of debt trends and consolidation needs	150
2.1.	Debt projections up to 2020	150
2.2.	Breakdown of the contributions to the debt projections	154
2.3.	Impact of risk scenarios on medium-term debt developments	155
3.	Output effects of high debt levels	165
3.1.	Transmission explained by theoretical models	165
3.2.	The empirical evidence on debt, growth and interest rates	166
3.3.	The Quest model: output effects of public debt	169
4.	Determinants of successful fiscal consolidations	171
4.1.	Achieving successful fiscal consolidations: what is specific to the current debt increase episode?	172
4.2.	Fiscal consolidation, financial crises and the business cycle: descriptive evidence	173
4.3.	The determinants of successful fiscal consolidations and financial crises: econometric evidence	175
5.	Tax policy and fiscal consolidation	180
5.1.	Introduction	180
5.2.	Tax level and growth	180
5.3.	Tax structure and growth	181
5.4.	Design of individual taxes	183
6.	Simulations of the output effect of fiscal consolidations	185
7.	Case studies	193
7.1.	Finland	193
7.2.	Sweden	197
7.3.	Japan	202
7.4.	Key lessons	206

Part IV:	Fiscal policy and external imbalances	207
	Summary	209
	1. External imbalances signaling underlying budgetary imbalances	211
	2. Literature review on the relation between the current account balance and government fiscal balances	215
	3. Macro-financial and (contingent) fiscal risks - an analysis with composite indicators	220
	3.1. Selecting and grouping risk indicators	220
	3.2. Developing composite risk indicators	221
	3.3. Static analysis	222
	3.4. Dynamic analysis of macro-financial and fiscal risk	224
	4. External imbalances and the success of fiscal consolidations	233
	4.1. External imbalances, exchange rate variation and fiscal consolidations: descriptive evidence	234
	4.2. External imbalances, real exchange rates and the success of fiscal consolidations: results from probit estimations	237
	5. Case studies - fiscal policy and external imbalance	240
	5.1. Spain	240
	5.2. Germany	241
	5.3. Ireland	244
	5.4. Estonia	247
	5.5. Concluding remarks	250
Part V:	Resources	251
	1. Abbreviations and symbols used	252
	2. Glossary	257
	3. References	264
	4. Useful internet links	272

LIST OF TABLES

I.1.1.	Budget balances in EU Member States (% of GDP)	14
I.1.2.	Euro area - General government budget balance (% of GDP)	15
I.1.3.	Composition of changes in the government debt ratio in EU Member States (% of GDP)	16
I.1.4.	Euro Area – Government revenue and expenditures (% of GDP)	17
I.1.5.	Government revenue and expenditure (% of GDP)	18
I.2.1.	Overview EDP steps – Euro area Member States	44
I.2.2.	Overview EDP steps – Non-euro area Member States	45
I.3.1.	MTOs 2009-10 and 2008-09 round of SCPs	53
I.3.2.	Assessment of the MTOs in the 2009-2010 updates of the stability and convergence programmes	54
I.3.3.	Budgetary developments according to the 2009-2010 Stability and Convergence Programme updates	54
I.3.4.	Overview of the Council opinions on the SCPs – summary assessments and policy invitations	55
I.4.1.	Increase in age-related expenditure, 2010-2060, % of GDP	68

I.4.2.	Main factors considered in reaching an overall assessment of the public finance sustainability risks	71
I.5.1.	Measures included in the 2009-2010 SCPs to reform domestic fiscal frameworks	75
II.1.1.	Recommendations under the Excessive Deficit Procedure	88
II.4.1.	Subcomponents of the MTOs	119
II.5.1.	Econometric estimation of the link between the output gap and discretionary measures. Panel (fixed-effect) estimations	130
II.6.1.	CABS and CAABS in EU countries	132
III.1.1.	The success rate of fiscal consolidations under alternative success criteria	148
III.1.2.	The success rate of fiscal consolidations: gradual consolidations vs. cold showers	149
III.2.1.	Level and increases in projected age-related expenditure as a share of GDP	151
III.4.1.	The success rate of fiscal consolidations and the business cycle: evidence for the EU and non-EU OECD countries 1970-2008	174
III.4.2.	The determinants of successful fiscal consolidations, financial crises and the business cycle	177
III.4.3.	The interaction between expenditure-cut/ tax increase-based consolidations and the starting business cycle position: evidence from probit estimations	178
III.6.1.	Fiscal multipliers for temporary stimulus	186
III.6.2.	Fiscal consolidation: permanent reduction deficit to GDP ratio 1% of GDP	189
III.7.1.	Overview of Finnish economy before, during and after the crisis	195
III.7.2.	Average annual increases in spending - crisis years and recovery	195
III.7.3.	Average annual percentage change in general government expenditure and revenue 1985-1998	200
III.7.4.	Key indicators in Sweden 1986-1998	201
III.7.5.	Contributions to budget consolidation (% of GDP)	201
III.7.6.	Overview of the Japanese economy before, during and after the crisis (% of GDP)	203
III.7.7.	Fiscal measures introduced on a project cost basis (% of GDP)	205
IV.2.1.	Overview of literature on the relation between fiscal policy and the current account balance	216
IV.3.1.	List of indicators of budgetary risk, macro-financial risk and budgetary adjustment rigidity	221
IV.4.1.	External imbalances and the success of fiscal consolidations: result from probit estimations	239
IV.5.1.	Key macroeconomic and budgetary indicators - Spain	241
IV.5.2.	Key macroeconomic and budgetary indicators - Germany	243
IV.5.3.	Key macroeconomic and budgetary indicators - Ireland	246
IV.5.4.	Key macroeconomic and budgetary indicators - Estonia	248

LIST OF GRAPHS

I.3.1.	GDP growth assumptions (EU27)	46
I.3.2.	Potential GDP growth (EU27)	47
I.3.3.	Difference in growth assumptions (SCP-COM) in 2011 and its breakdown	47
I.3.4.	Net lending position according to programme scenario (EU27)	48
I.3.5.	Change in net lending by sector (pp. of GDP, 2010 compared to 2008)	48
I.3.6.	Change in net lending by sector (pp. of GDP, 2013 compared to 2010)	48
I.3.7.	Planned changes in government deficits over 2010-2012/13 in the SCPs (in % of GDP)	49
I.3.8.	Degree of frontloading of the adjustment and indicators of fiscal and macro-financial vulnerabilities	51

I.3.9.	Average annual change in the revenue and expenditure ratios planned over the 2010-2012/2013 period versus the estimated revenue and expenditure ratios in 2009	51
I.3.10.	Planned changes in revenue and expenditure over 2010-2012/13 in the SCPs (% of GDP)	52
I.3.11.	Average annual planned change in nominal expenditure over the 2010-2012/2013 period versus average annual planned change in the expenditure ratios over the same period	53
I.5.1.	Information on national fiscal frameworks included in the 2009 2010 updates of the SCPs	74
I.5.2.	Detailed information on reform plans included in the 2009 2010 updates of the SCPs	74
I.5.3.	Type of reforms according to the main elements of domestic fiscal frameworks	75
I.5.4.	Reformed and new fiscal rules	76
I.5.5.	Reformed and new MTBFs according to the SCPs	77
I.5.6.	Reforms of budgetary procedures in the SCPs	77
I.5.7.	Council policy invitations on last year's SCPs by type of measure (as a % of total measures)	78
I.5.8.	Council policy invitations on this year's SCPs by type of measure (as a % of total measures)	78
II.3.1.	Domestic fiscal frameworks based on the expenditure side	113
II.4.1.	Triple aim of the MTOs	116
II.5.1.	One to four-step ahead revision standard deviations (x 100) for four different time horizons	124
II.5.2.	Gross and net (for the impact of discretionary measures) tax elasticities to GDP and output gap: direct taxes	126
II.5.3.	Gross and net (for the impact of discretionary measures) tax elasticities to GDP and output gap: indirect taxes	126
II.5.4.	Gross and net (for the impact of discretionary measures) tax elasticities to GDP and output gap: social security contributions	127
II.5.5.	Gross and net tax elasticities to GDP and output gap: total tax revenues	128
II.6.1.	Difference between CAAB and CAB, selected euro-area countries	134
II.6.2.	Difference between CAAB and CAB for selected New Member States	135
III.1.1.1.	Public debt in EU Member States, 2007-2011 (in % of GDP)	142
III.1.1.2.	Gross public debt crises episodes (% of GDP) during financial crises	143
III.1.1.3.	Evolution of debt to GDP ratio during major debt increase episodes	143
III.1.1.4.	Moving up the ladder: debt increases and starting debt levels during major debt increases episodes in the EU15 since 1970	145
III.1.1.5.	Large debt increases and fiscal consolidation episodes in the EU, 1970-2008	146
III.1.1.6.	Evolution of the debt to GDP ratio following a large debt increase episode	149
III.2.1.1.	Medium-term projections for the average government debt-to-GDP ratio in the EU and in the euro area	151
III.2.2.	Medium-term projections for the government debt-to-GDP ratio in the EU Member States assuming implementation of consolidation plans in the SCPs	157
III.2.3.	Medium-term projections for the government debt-to-GDP ratio in the EU Member States with different risk scenarios	161
III.3.1.1.	Output effects of permanent 10 percentage point increase in debt-to-GDP ratios with and without sovereign risk premium	169
III.3.2.	Output effects of permanent 10 percentage point increase in debt-to-GDP ratios with economy-wide risk premium	170
III.4.1.1.	The success rate of fiscal consolidation and financial crises episodes (% of consolidation episodes leading to reduction of debt level by at least 5 pp GDP 3 years later)	175

III.4.2.	The probability of success of gradual and cold shower fiscal consolidation depending the level and snowball effect of public debt	179
III.5.1.	Shares of indirect taxes, direct taxes and social contributions in overall tax revenues	182
III.5.2.	Change in share of indirect taxes, direct taxes and social contributions in overall tax revenues, 1995-2008, in percentage points	183
III.6.1.	GDP effects fiscal consolidation	188
III.6.2.	GDP impacts permanent fiscal consolidations	190
III.6.3.	Permanent fiscal consolidations: government balance and debt to GDP ratios	191
III.7.1.	Key public finance variables, Finland 1988-2000	193
III.7.2.	Exports and the exchange rate, Finland 1987-2000	194
III.7.3.	Gross fixed capital formation (left hand axis) and R&D expenditure (right hand axis) as a share of GDP, Finland and OECD	196
III.7.4.	Average income tax rates and total tax wedge by type of earner 1989-1995	197
III.7.5.	Key public finance variables, Sweden 1985-2000	198
III.7.6.	Key public finance variables, Japan 1988-2006	202
III.7.7.	Exports and the exchange rate, Japan 1987-2005	203
III.7.8.	Finland, Sweden and Japan exchange rates and export shares	206
IV.1.1.1.	Nominal unit labour costs– selected euro-area countries (2000=100)	211
IV.1.1.2.	Nominal unit labour costs– selected non-euro-area countries (2000=100)	211
IV.1.1.3.	Changes in (i) the current account (relative to EU16 average) and versus changes in nominal revenues (relative to EU16 average) in EMU (2000 – 2007)	211
IV.1.1.4.	Changes in the real effective exchange rate (relative to EU16 average) versus changes in nominal revenues (relative to EU16 average) in EMU (2000 – 2007)	212
IV.1.1.5.	Level of the current account balance in 2008 vs changes in the current account balance 2008-10 – euro-area Member States	213
IV.1.1.6.	Level of the current account balance in 2008 vs changes in the current account balance 2008-10 – non-euro-area Member States	213
IV.1.1.7.	Current account balance in 2008 and cumulative domestic demand contribution to growth 2008-10 - euro-area Member States	213
IV.1.1.8.	Current account balance in 2008 and cumulative domestic demand contribution to growth 2008-10 - non-euro-area Member States	214
IV.2.1.1.	Fiscal policy and current account balances: macro and micro linkages	219
IV.3.1.1.	Indicators of macro-financial and fiscal risk for EU Member States (2010)	222
IV.3.1.2.	Development of average macro risk of the five EU countries with the highest (left) and lowest (right) increase in fiscal risk over 2007-09	226
IV.3.1.3.	Development of average macro risk of the five euro-area countries with the highest (left) and lowest (right) increase in fiscal risk over 2007-09	226
IV.3.1.4.	2007 macro-financial risk indicator versus change in fiscal risk indicator over the period 2007-09	227
IV.3.1.5.	Change in average revenues growth between period 2004-07 and 2007-10 versus the 2007 macro-financial risk indicator	227
IV.3.1.6.	Contribution of components to the aggregate indicator	228
IV.3.1.7.	Contribution of components to the composite macrofinancial risk indicator (main approach)	229
IV.3.1.8.	Development of the composite fiscal and macro-financial risk indicators in EU Member States (2000-2009)	230
IV.4.1.1.	Successful and unsuccessful consolidations and real and nominal exchange rates in selected sample of countries	235
IV.4.1.2.	Past current account variations and the success of fiscal consolidations: evidence using Kernel density graphs	237
IV.5.1.1.	Real effective exchange rate versus the rest of the euro area	242
IV.5.1.2.	Net lending (+) / borrowing (-) (% of GDP)	242

LIST OF BOXES

I.1.1.	The EERP and the withdrawal of temporary measures in product and labour markets	19
I.1.2.	Rethinking the automatic stabilisers	22
I.1.3.	The impact of government interventions supporting financial institutions on public finances	24
I.2.1.	The excessive deficit procedure	28
I.2.2.	The EU's response to the crisis in Greece: financial support conditional on implementing a programme of economic adjustment	30
II.1.1.	Fiscal exit strategy: principles agreed by the Ecofin Council on 20 October 2009	86
II.1.2.	Establishing a European stabilisation mechanism	90
II.1.3.	Balance-of-payments assistance and policy conditionality	91
II.1.4.	Reinforcing compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact and deeper fiscal policy coordination: The Commission Communication of 12 May 2010	92
II.3.1.	Key elements in the design of fiscal rules	101
II.3.2.	Important elements in the design of independent fiscal institutions	106
II.3.3.	Key elements in the design of MTBFs	108
II.3.4.	The seven dimensions of the budget process	110
II.4.1.	Relevant provisions in the Code of Conduct	118
II.5.1.	A joint model for TFP and capacity utilisation	122
II.6.1.	Estimating cyclically and absorption-adjusted budget balances	133
III.2.1.	Assumptions underlying the medium term projections for gross debt of the general government	153
III.3.1.	The effect of deficits and debt on the sovereign risk premium	168
III.6.1.	The QUEST III model	192
IV.3.1.	Methodology and robustness of composite indicators	223